



MEMORANDUM IN OPPOSITION

FOR IMMEDIATE RELEASE: JANUARY 15, 2010

Re: A.4301-A(Canestrari)/S.5204(Breslin) – AN ACT to amend the public health law, in relation to requirements for collective negotiations by health care providers with certain health benefit plans.

90 State Street • Suite 825
Albany, NY 12207-1717
518.462.2293
Fax: 518.462.2150
www.nyhpa.org

The New York Health Plan Association (HPA) opposes A.4301-A/S.5204, which authorizes collective negotiations for certain health care providers. This proposal is anti-consumer as it will result in consumers and employers facing higher prices for health insurance coverage and make it more difficult for New York to attain universal coverage.

Historically, antitrust laws have effectively protected consumers from predatory price-fixing in a variety of industries including health care. Currently, these laws prohibit independent physicians from engaging in collective efforts to set the price for medical services. This has benefited patients by encouraging greater choice, higher quality products and services, and innovative approaches to health care delivery. Current law has been crucial to promoting competition and preventing local provider monopolies that would allow physicians to set unfair prices. This legislation would diminish competition to the detriment of premium payers and patients.

Opposition to this legislation is widespread:

- ◆ The **United States Department of Justice**, in conjunction with the **Federal Trade Commission**, issued a report in 2004 (*Improving Health Care: A Dose of Competition*) condemning provider collective bargain stating that such measures would “likely harm consumers by increasing costs without improving quality of care.”
- ◆ The **Center for Medical Consumers** opposes this measure, because it raises concerns about giving “economic power back to health care providers who have a long history of behaviors motivated by self-interest rather than the public interest.”

Legislators’ interest to allow collective bargaining represents a substantial reversal of long-standing public policy of endorsing competitive approaches to health care. Although advocates cite the need to “level the playing field” to counter “unbelievable market domination” by payers, an examination of New York’s marketplace portrays a healthy competitive environment. In October 2005, **The United States Government Accounting Office** (GAO) released data that reported that the number of health plans operating in New York exceeded the national median number of licensed carriers in the small group market by 30%. Furthermore, the median share of the small group market held by the states largest carrier is **50% less** than the national average.

Despite claims to the contrary, this legislation is solely designed to increase physician compensation. This is ironic because at a time when the nation debates healthcare reform and New York continues to explore universal health care options, it would seem illogical to direct limited resources to further compensate physicians who are widely recognized as one of the wealthiest professions in the nation.

HPA urges the legislature to focus on improving quality and affordability of health care, and to reject measures that foster price-fixing. **A.4301-A/S.5204** is bad medicine for all New Yorkers.

The New York Health Plan Association represents 25 managed care health plans that provide comprehensive health care services to nearly 7 million New Yorkers.